

**United States Court of Appeals**

**For The Eighth Circuit**

Thomas F. Eagleton U.S. Courthouse  
111 South 10th Street, Room 24.329

**St. Louis, Missouri 63102**

**Michael E. Gans**  
*Clerk of Court*

**VOICE (314) 244-2400**  
**FAX (314) 244-2780**  
[www.ca8.uscourts.gov](http://www.ca8.uscourts.gov)

February 10, 2021

Ms. Wilma M. Pennington-Thurman  
P.O. Box 771201  
Saint Louis, MO 63177

RE: 20-1993 Wilma Pennington-Thurman v. Federal Home Loan Mortgage, et al

Dear Ms. Pennington-Thurman:

The court has issued an opinion in this case. Judgment has been entered in accordance with the opinion. The opinion will be released to the public at 10:00 a.m. today. Please hold the opinion in confidence until that time.

Please review [Federal Rules of Appellate Procedure](#) and the [Eighth Circuit Rules](#) on post-submission procedure to ensure that any contemplated filing is timely and in compliance with the rules. Note particularly that petitions for rehearing and petitions for rehearing en banc must be received in the clerk's office within 14 days of the date of the entry of judgment. Counsel-filed petitions must be filed electronically in CM/ECF. Paper copies are not required. No grace period for mailing is allowed, and the date of the postmark is irrelevant for pro-se-filed petitions. Any petition for rehearing or petition for rehearing en banc which is not received within the 14 day period for filing permitted by FRAP 40 may be denied as untimely.

Michael E. Gans  
Clerk of Court

NDW

Enclosure(s)

cc: Mr. Gregory J. Linhares  
Office of U.S. Trustee  
Mr. Charles Smathers Pullium III  
Mr. Brian C. Walsh

District Court/Agency Case Number(s): 4:19-cv-03093-HEA

United States Court of Appeals  
For the Eighth Circuit

---

No. 20-1993

---

In re: Wilma M. Pennington-Thurman,

*Debtor.*

---

Wilma M. Pennington-Thurman,

*Appellant,*

v.

Federal Home Loan Mortgage Corporation; Millsap & Singer, LLC; Bank of America, N.A.,

*Appellees,*

Office of *U.S. Trustee,*

*U.S. Trustee.*

---

Appeal from United States District Court  
for the Eastern District of Missouri - St. Louis

---

Submitted: February 5, 2021  
Filed: February 10, 2021  
[Unpublished]

---

Before COLLTON, MELLOY, and GRASZ, Circuit Judges.

---

PER CURIAM.

Wilma Pennington-Thurman appeals the district court's<sup>1</sup> order affirming the bankruptcy court's order denying her motion to reopen her bankruptcy case. We conclude that the bankruptcy court did not abuse its discretion. The adversary case that Pennington-Thurman sought to pursue addressed previously litigated issues or otherwise lacked merit, so reopening would have been futile. *See Apex Oil Co. v. Sparks (In re Apex Oil Co.)*, 406 F.3d 538, 541 (8th Cir. 2005); *Mid-City Bank v. Skyline Woods Homeowners Ass'n (In re Skyline Woods Country Club, LLC)*, 431 B.R. 830, 837-38 (B.A.P. 8th Cir. 2010); *Realan Inv. Partners, LLLP v. Meininger (In re Land Res., LLC)*, 505 B.R. 571, 582 (M.D. Fla. 2014).

The judgment is affirmed. *See* 8th Cir. R. 47B.

---

---

<sup>1</sup>The Honorable Henry E. Autrey, United States District Judge for the Eastern District of Missouri.